Reviewer's report

Title: Calcium phosphate-hybridized tendon graft to enhance tendon-bone healing two years after ACL reconstruction in goats

Version: 1 Date: 11 May 2011

Reviewer number: 3

Reviewer's report:

Abstract; well-written

Key words; appropriate

Introduction

Pg 5 line 8; Please describe technique to enhance healing at tendon-bone interface, such as periosteum patch, hydrogel containing periosteal progenitor cell, BMP...

Pg 5 line 13; Please describe relationship between number of osteoclast and tunnel widening.

Pg 6 line 1; From the previously published literatures, postoperative knee stability was not correlated with the tunnel widening. Therefore, I cannot agree that less AP translation was shown in CaP-treated group than control group because of dense bone formation at tendon-bone interface.

Pg 6 line 8; Why "minimal articular cartilage degeneration after ACL reconstruction" in a goat model?

Pg 6 line 13; After "of the tendon graft.", please provide reference.

Materials and Methods

Pg 8 line 2; Provide name of city and State after Smith & Nephew.

Pg 8 line 17; Why did the authors make a 5.5-mm tunnel?

Pg 10 line 4; Usually cross-sectional area of the tunnel at aperture is oval rather than circular shape. How did the authors measure accurately?

Pg 11 line 4-6; Please add diagram or photo to enhance understanding of the readers.

Results

Pg 11 line 15; "as determined by CT" can be deleted.

Pg 12 line 2; Please describe p-value respectively.

Discussion

too verbose.
Pg 14 line 12; "found" would be better than "detected".
Pg 15 line 13; "may promote" would be better than "promotes".
Pg 17 line 6-7; Enlargement of the articular end of the bony tunnels is caused by several etiologies, not only by osteoclasts.
Pg 17 line 9; "recent" needs to be deleted because the author quoted a literature published 2003.
Pg 17 line 9-11; These lines needs to be deleted. Most literatures reported tunnel widening after ACL reconstructions was not related with postoperative knee instability.
Pg 17 line 14-16; These lines are speculation of the authors.
Pg 18 line 11-12; These lines are speculation of the authors.
Pg 19 line 3-6; These lines are speculation of the authors.

References
ref 1,3,6,7,8,11,12 Cite all named authors.
ref 2,5; I cannot find those in the medline.
ref 4; "Arch" is correct rather than "Archives".
ref 8; delete "(7pp)".
ref 9; name of manuscript "Calcium phosphate-hybridised tendon graft to reduce bone-tunnel enlargement after ACL reconstruction in goats" is correct.
ref 10; a author "Hattori S" is missing.
name of manuscript "Effect of calcium phosphate-hybridized tendon graft ~" is correct.
ref 22; name of manuscript "Osteogenesis in tendon and ligament insertions in the area of the original chondral apophyses" is corrrct and name of journal "Z Zellforsch Mikrosk Anat" is correct.

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.