Reviewer's report

Title: Body Dysmorphic Disorder: Gender Differences and Prevalence in a Pakistani Medical Student Population

Version: 1 Date: 6 January 2008

Reviewer: Leonardo Fontenelle

Reviewer's report:

Major compulsory revisions

1. The rationale supporting the use of a sample of medical students in order to investigate body dysmorphic disorder (BDD) is not clear. It is doubtful how body self-image disturbances might specifically impact medical practice or the perception of patient's physical defects.

1. As the authors have stated in the limitation section of the article, the lack of data on validity and reliability of the Pakistani version of Body Image Disturbance Questionnaire (BIDQ) is a major problem.

2. About 31.4% of the sample reported fatness as a focus of concern. Since the BIDQ evaluates body image disturbance in general, it might be argued that the authors are not reporting the prevalence of BDD, but that of body image disorders in general, including eating disorders.

Minor Essential Revisions

3. The authors did not quote previous clinical studies conducted in developing countries, such as Turkey (which is also predominantly Muslim) and Brazil. These references need to be included.


4. The discussion section is a little redundant. The author could keep the quality of the discussion while avoiding repetition.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests