Reviewer’s report

Title: A comparison of supracostal and infracostal access in treating renal and upper ureteral stones using MPCNL with the aid of a patented system

Version: 2
Date: 21 May 2015

Reviewer: FILIPPO MARIA M TURRI

Reviewer’s report:

With this work the authors have demonstrated the feasibility of the upper caliceal system puncture using their patented system, confirming what is already known from literature (Comparison of supracostal versus infracostal percutaneous nephrolithotomy using the novel prone-flexed patient position. Honey RJ, Wiesenthal JD, Ghiculete D, et al. J Endourol. 2011 Jun;25(6):947-54. The safety and efficacy of PCNL with supracostal approach in the treatment of renal stones. Mousavi-Bahar SH, Mehrabi S, Moslemi MK. Int Urol Nephrol. 2011 Dec;43(4):983-7.): upper pole puncture is feasible, safe and has a comparable stone clearance rate with the known advantages of this approach in selected cases.

What’s is interesting is the new device used and the advantages the authors describe. Would be nice to know if there is any advantage also in terms of costs.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests