Editor's comment

Title: Adjuvant radio-chemotherapy for extrahepatic biliary tract cancers

Authors:

Marta Bonet (Bonet.marta@gmail.com)
Arnaud D Roth (Arnaud.Roth@hcuge.ch)
Gilles Mentha (Gilles.Mentha@hcuge.es)
Abdelkarim S Allal (Abdelkarim.Allal@hcuge.ch)

Version: 2 Date: 22 March 2011

Editor's comment:

Even though many relative papers had been published in the past, this study reports the first retrospective data on Swiss population treated with postoperative radiotherapy after radically surgical procedures in patients with EHBDC. The reviewers have gave authors good comments. I have some comments after read this manuscript and reviewers comments.

Some mistake in Figures. No figure 1 and 2. Figure 1 is figure 3 according to the text. Due to lacking figure 1, we do not know the dose range.

The authors collected clinical data from 1998 to 2004. Why there were not recent data? The authors must explain.

The authors must list the reference about RTOG/NCI-CTCAE V3.0 toxicity criteria.

The authors concluded that "some patients seem to have benefited from adjuvant treatment". This study did not have non-EBRT group, they did not compare two groups. This conclusion is not reasonable.

Minor comments: page 6 line 5 from bottom, 50,4 Gy should be changed to be 50.4 Gy

Page 10 1st line more than an a half should be changed to be more than one half.