Reviewer's report

Title: Preoperative Planning of Calcium Deposit Removal in Calcifying Tendinitis of the Rotator Cuff - Possible Contribution of Computer Tomography, Ultrasound and Conventional X-Ray

Version: 2 Date: 21 August 2014

Reviewer: Maurice Balke

Reviewer's report:

This is my review on the article entitled „Preoperative Planning of Calcium Deposit Removal in Calcifying Tendinitis of the Rotator Cuff - Possible Contribution of Computer Tomography, Ultrasound and Conventional X-Ray“.

The study presents interesting results regarding preoperative diagnostics in calcific tendinitis of the rotator cuff.

The article is well written with a sound methodology. In my opinion it is suitable for publication as it presents interesting and important results.

However I have the following remarks:

Minor essential revisions:

Abstract:
- line 32: Please correct spelling mistakes
- line 43 + 44: The sentence „careful attention has to be given during CD removal to small satellite deposits or septations that can be found regularly“ cannot be concluded by your results. You did not correlate the presence of satellite deposits with clinical outcome and the necessity of complete calcium removal is controversially discussed.

Background:
- Please add blanks before citations throughout the text

Methods:
- line 97: Here you state „all patients“ and later on you write that some of the patients did not have outlet view radiographs. Please state in the Methods sections how many patients received all radiographs and you many received the X-ray in your institution.
- line 106: Please change to computed tomography throughout the text

Results:
- Headline has different style

Discussion:
- Here you extensively discuss the importance of identifying satellite deposits and their removal respectively. You should also include in your discussion that there are plenty of studies showing that a (complete) removal of the deposits is not necessary [1-5].

Conclusions:
- line 270: I would recommend to change „Above this careful attention has to be drawn to satellite deposits or septations as they are present regularly and should be addressed to assure complete CD removal.“ To e.g. „It has to be noted that satellite deposits or septations are regularly present which is of importance if complete CD removal is aspired.“


Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests