Reviewer’s report

Title: A prospective cohort study of prognosis for newly diagnosed epilepsy in China

Version: 1 Date: 6 May 2013

Reviewer: Yao-Chung Chuang

Reviewer’s report:

This study is a prospective cohort study that included 180 patients with newly diagnosed epilepsy in Nanjing, China. Authors investigated the prognosis and risk factors for development of drug resistant epilepsy in this population. They concluded that multiple seizure types and seizure type changes during treatment are unfavorable prognostic factors. Although the scope of this study is not novel and similar studies have been reported in the literature, this article is well written and provided a new data in Chinese population. I just only give a few comments and suggestions in this article.

1. Since the duration of epilepsy is significant between 2 outcome groups (Table 2), the definition of “duration of epilepsy” is important. Whether the duration of epilepsy for initial treatment (time to treatment) is a significantly prognostic factor?

2. Some patients with a relative short period of clinical follow-up (only 2 years) and the smaller sample size in this study that may influence the result and the incidence of drug-resistant epilepsy. The author should mention this point in the discussion.

3. Nanjing is a city with excellent economic condition and good healthcare device, the result from this study cannot completely reflect the prognosis for newly diagnosed epilepsy “in China”.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests