Reviewer's report

Title: Increased deep sleep in a medication-free, detoxified female offender with schizophrenia, alcoholism and a history of attempted homicide: Case report

Version: 1 Date: 12 October 2004

Reviewer: Ann Sharpley

Reviewer's report:

General

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

This article could be improved by the expansion of the background information. The references quoted for the effects of schizophrenia and alcoholism on sleep are from one book. For example, work by Armitage suggests that slow wave activity is impaired in major depressive disorder but not in schizophrenia. Also see Goder et al 2004 (J Psychiatr Res 38(6) 591-9. They look at visuospatial memory and decreased SWS in 17 schizophrenics. A more complete literature review is warranted. REM abnormalities should also be discussed.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Please state that the recordings were carried out in the subject's own home/hospital bed. Was the patient in a single room? Please indicate the extent of caffeine intake. The decrease in total sleep time in the patient could be due to the hospital routine rather than the patient's usual sleep pattern. This needs to be clarified and discussed. Was the scorer blind to patient group?

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

Sleep diary information would be of interest. How did the daytime activity between patient and controls compare. Exercise can affect the amount of SWS. The use of actigraphy would have been a useful addition to the study.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

None