

Reviewer's report

Title: Coronary Age as a Risk Factor in the Modified Framingham Risk Score

Version: 2 Date: 30 October 2003

Reviewer: Judith Hsia

Reviewer's report:

General

The authors present an interesting refinement of the Framingham algorithm for estimating coronary risk, replacing chronological age with coronary calcium score-adjusted age.

1. The significant limitation of this paper is that they provide no evidence that their proposed method represents an improvement over the predictive value of the existing Framingham algorithm or of free-standing coronary calcium score. The manuscript may still be worth publishing for the purpose of airing this concept. In the paragraph discussing MESA, the necessity for validation should be explicitly stated and consideration given to application of the proposed approach in other cohorts such as EDIC, Framingham offspring, ARIC.
2. Should also discuss limitations in middle-age women, for whom calcium scores are generally 0, and thus addition of this information doesn't add to Framingham model.
3. There may also be an ethnicity issue, as ranges of calcium scores predicting low, medium or high risk in white and non-white adults.
4. In the Framingham risk calculation example, the contribution of blood pressure has been omitted.
5. Manuscript seemed long. Perhaps "Background" could be shortened by deleting some of the description of NCEP & Framingham algorithm.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

Minor Compulsory Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. the NCEP reference should be the final version of guidelines, published in Circ December 2002

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

none