

Reviewer's report

Title: Wellness through a comprehensive Yogic Breathing Program - A controlled pilot trial

Version: 4 **Date:** 5 October 2007

Reviewer: Ronald Feise

Reviewer's report:

General

The purpose of a pilot study cannot, by definition, be to investigate whether an intervention is effective. Thus, your study design is inappropriate for the question. A pilot study is essential to the planning of a well-designed full-scale trial, because a number of important issues need to be unraveled before time and suitable funding is committed. The results of a pilot study suggest whether it is feasible to proceed to a full study. A pilot study examines issues such as safety, patient recruitment and compliance, treatment standardization, quality assurance, sample size, outcome measure selection and statistical analysis. Caution is needed in the interpretation of data from any pilot study. No conclusion about the effectiveness can be rendered. It is impossible to make any causal inferences. The findings may be the result of non-treatment factors.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Reject because scientifically unsound

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.