

## Reviewer's report

**Title:** The clinical meaningfulness of ADAS-Cog changes in Alzheimers disease patients treated with donepezil in an open-label trial

**Version: 1 Date:** 9 May 2007

**Reviewer:** Martin R Farlow

### Reviewer's report:

Rockwood et al. examine the clinical meaningfulness of ADAS-cog changes in Alzheimer's disease patients treated with donepezil. They seemed to demonstrate better concordance between improvements in ADAS-cog than decline when comparing this instrument's ability to measure change.

In general, the methodology and instruments are well described as are the comparisons and analyses. The general lack of concordance of ADAS-cog with clinical global measure has been described by a number of authors in the past. The lack of concordance is not surprising as general global measures tend to focus on domains involving executive functioning, which in particular is a major factor characterizing deterioration through mild to moderate stages of AD, while ADAS-cog does not assess executive functioning and thus ADAS-cog is not really a 'global' assessment of cognitive functioning.

It would be interesting to know at least generally which domains were targeted in the global measures and what cognitive functions would be recognized for their performance (i.e., for a chosen domain would memory or orientation or executive functioning be required?). These data might better inform the reasons behind observed differences.

-----  
Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-----  
Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-----  
Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

**What next?:** Accept after minor essential revisions

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

### Declaration of competing interests:

Dr. Farlow is

Consultant for : Abbott , Anthenagen, Inc., Cephalon, GlaxoSmithKline, Memory Pharma., Merck, Novartis, Sanofi-Aventis, Talecris Biother.

Grant support from: Eli Lilly, Novartis Pharm, Ono/Pharmanet

Speakers bureau for Forest Labs, Pfizer/Eisai, and Novartis