

Reviewer's report

Title: The course of mental health after miscarriage and induced abortion: A five-year follow-up study.

Version: 1 **Date:** 15 July 2005

Reviewer: Ellen Wiebe

Reviewer's report:

General

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

There are statistical findings comparing the two groups and yet no sample size calculation or power calculations to say these are valid. The two groups appear to have different levels of mental health prior to the event, although this is non significant, which may have more impact on the findings than the "characteristics of the pregnancy termination event". This is not discussed in the "Discussion" or "Conclusion". Women having unwanted pregnancies include women who are stable and happy but have not finished their education or have finished their families. They also include women who are having abortions because they have financial difficulties, unstable relationships, chronic mental illness and/or high stress. The life circumstances causing a woman to choose to abort the pregnancy are not discussed. Most clinicians reading this type of paper can understand a chi square only with the p value and can't understand the r value at all. It is important to describe your data so that the ordinary clinician caring for women understands it (with a little extra for the statisticians). The figures show your data in a much more understandable form but should explain what avoidance and intrusion mean. If you could display all the data in Tables 2 and 3 in the form of graphs, it would be so much clearer.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests