Reviewer's report

Title: The usefulness of growth hormone treatment for psychological status in young adult survivors of childhood leukaemia: an open-label study

Version: 1 Date: 6 January 2008

Reviewer: Bjarnason Ragnar

Reviewer's report:

This is an important work, which has implications in the current debate if ALL survivors with GHD may benefit from GH treatment. It is generally well written and clear. There are, however, some issues that need to be addressed:

Major Compulsatory Revisions:

There is extensive information given on the GH tests, however, detailed results are missing. Only mention of results is the 4 patients that had low GHmax on ITT but not GHRH. Were all other below 3Åµg/L in both tests?

There is an extensive analysis of IGF-I changes and changes in performance. What about GH testing (GHmax) and performance?

Values and p values of non significant changes in performance should be included.

Minor Essential Revisions:

Page 5,9: The association between cognitive function.... Binding sites for GH and IGF-I is not the same as neuronal connection.

Page 5, methods, patients: Why were these inclusion criteria chosen? IGF-I levels and spontaneous GH secretion do not correlate in this group of patients (Pediatric Blood & Cancer 2004;42(7):582-588. Bone mineral density in young adults is not reliable either for detecting GHD.

Page 7: 20 included, 3 not started, 17 (12/5) with 4 stopped, 2 because of pregnancy; total treated 13 (9/4)!

Page 11,3: After the second... Was the short- and long-term abnormal? Change wording since normalization implies they were.

Page 11,24: Healthy subjects... Better compared to what?

Discretionary Revisions:

None

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests