

Reviewer's report

Title: Is FKBP5 a genetic marker of depression? A case-control study and analysis of disease related traits

Version: 3 **Date:** 25 July 2006

Reviewer: Eiji Hattori

Reviewer's report:

General

Gawlick and colleagues examined association between the gene for FKBP5 and mood disorders in the analysis of Caucasian case-control samples of German origin. The data presented are of substantial interest given its role in the HPA axis and the documented association with response to antidepressant treatment and with the number of depressive episodes in the analysis of samples with the same ethnicity. Overall interpretation of the results seems to be appropriately done with caution.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Since estimation of rare haplotype frequency is susceptible to genotyping errors, it might be sensible to refrain from presenting data on haplotypes with a frequency $<.05$. Also, authors might note that the study includes numerous post-hoc analyses, which involve dividing a small sample size into even smaller fractions. Unless testing is for association with either drug-responsiveness or the number of episodes, it is no longer confirmatory analyses and the issue of multiple comparisons would have to be addressed or at least be noted.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.