

## **Reviewer's report**

**Title:** Do Inattention and Hyperactivity Symptoms Equal Scholastic Impairment? Evidence from three European Cohorts

**Version: 2 Date:** 18 June 2007

**Reviewer:** Carlin Miller

### **Reviewer's report:**

General

This manuscript connects the presence of ADHD-associated behaviors with academic difficulties in multiple European cohorts. Although these authors have revised the manuscript somewhat and have provided more statistical information, it is still not clear that this study contributes meaningfully to the literature. Furthermore, there are significant methodological problems with this manuscript that have not been addressed sufficiently. These remain my concerns:

1. Using teacher ratings only provides very limited information about the behavior problems, and does not correct for "negative halo effects" associated with method bias. Although this is listed as a limitation, noting this as a limitation is not sufficient.
2. The authors reported that teachers are valid reporters of academic difficulties. I have no disagreement with this statement. I am concerned that the data collection strategy for ascertaining academic difficulties was invalid. Without reporting the psychometric characteristics (e.g., reliability and validity) of this strategy, I can only assume this strategy is less appropriate than other strategies.

**What next?:** Reject because too small an advance to publish

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

### **Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.