Reviewer’s report

Title: Fgf20 is not genetically associated with Parkinson’s disease in Finnish and Greek patients

Version: 1 Date: 28 April 2005

Reviewer: Roger Barker

Reviewer’s report:

General

---------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

This study investigates in 151 and 144 Parkinson’s disease patients from Greece and Finland respectively, an association of this condition to FGF20 using equal numbers of control patients. The authors find no such association and thus conclude that FGF20 is not a risk factor for PD in these ethnic groups. This contrasts to an earlier report from last year reporting such an association in a different ethnic group.

This seems a relatively straightforward study both intellectually and practically. The sample sizes are relatively small which does undermine the power of any negative conclusions but the authors acknowledge that in their discussion. The cases seem to have been diagnosed using standard criteria and in each case adequate attention has been paid to controls although no comment is made on their source and detailed assessment. Overall this is a clear negative study from a somewhat underpowered study.

---------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Page 5 “….just a slightly decrease”

In the discussion there is a sentence inserted in the second paragraph which seems to be inappropriate.

---------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests' below